

Shaykh Sālim at-Taweel
(hafīdhahullāh)

A SECOND LETTER TO DR MUHAMMAD BIN HĀDĪ AL- MADKHALĪ¹

“THOSE WHO CRITICISE YOU, REFUTE YOU OR DIFFER WITH YOU, HAVE NOT ALL LEFT SALAFIYYAH AS A RESULT OF THAT, AS YOU ARE NOT THE SENIOR SYMBOL OF SALAFIYYAH IN THAT WHOEVER YOU ARE NOT PLEASED WITH, OR YOU DO NOT GIVE TAZKIYAH TO, MUST NECESSITATE HIS EXPULSION FROM SALAFIYYAH. FOR SALAFIYYAH IS THE DEEN OF ALLĀH AND ALLĀH DID NOT PLACE IT IN THE HAND OF ANY ONE PERSON AND NONE IS EXPELLED FROM IT EXCEPT WITH A DIVINELY LEGISLATED REASON, ALL PRAISE IS DUE TO ALLĀH”

All praise is due to Allāh, there is no transgression except on the oppressors and the final destination is for the pious; and may prayers and peace be upon our Prophet, and on his family and all of his companions to proceed:

This is a letter which is directed to all to whom it is applicable generally and to Shaykh Muhammad bin Hādī al-Madkhalī al-Madanī specifically. O Shaykh Muhammad bin Hādī, may Allāh guide you to the Straight Path.

¹ Shaykh Sālim at-Taweel, *Wa Aydhan Risālah Lam Yahmiluhā al-Bareed ilā Shaykh Muhammad bin Hādī al-Madkhalī Shafā’ahu Allāh wa ’Āfāhu*. [And Also a Letter Which Cannot be Delivered by Post to Shaykh Muhammad bin Hādī al-Madkhalī, May Allāh Cure him]. Dated 7 Muharram 1435 AH/31 October 2014 CE, see:

<http://www.saltaweel.com/articles/368>

Translated by 'AbdulHaq al-Ashanti

As-salāmu alaykum wa rahmatullāhi wa barakātuhu.

It has been relayed from Imām Mālik bin Anas al-Madanī (*rahimabullāh*) that he said:

There is none of us except that he can have his statement accepted or rejected except for the one in this grave [i.e. the Prophet, *sallallāhu 'alayhi wassallam*]. Everyone can have his statement accepted or rejected except for the one in this grave.

Meaning Allāh's Messenger (*sallAllāhu 'alayhi wassallam*). Similar has also been reported from Mujāhid also. It is reported from 'Abdullāh bin al-Imām Ahmad in *Zawā'id uḥ-Zubd* via the route of 'Ikrimah from Ibn 'Abbās (*radi Allāhu 'anhu*) that he said: "There is no person who can have his statement accepted except for the Prophet (*sallAllāhu 'alayhi wassallam*)." This is a foundation from the foundations of the Sunnah, Allāh has said:

“O you who have believed, do not put [yourselves] before Allāh and His Messenger but fear Allāh. Indeed, Allāh is Hearing and Knowing.”

{*al-Hujurat* (49): 1}

There is nobody who is above criticism, no one has his words accepted and no one has to be followed except for Allāh's Messenger (*sallAllāhu 'alayhi wassallam*). This matter, though theoretical, it is universally acknowledged [Musallam] except that it is unrealistically and undisciplined with many people even with those who ascribe to the Sunnah and Salafiyyah in method, creed and religion. O Shaykh Muhammad, may Allāh grant you success, the time has come for me to face you and face all who have bias and partisanship to you or other than you as you are not above criticism. **Those who criticise you, refute you or differ with you, have not all left Salafiyyah as a result of that, as you are not the senior symbol of Salafiyyah in that whoever you are not pleased with, or you do not give tazkiyah to, must necessitate his expulsion from Salafiyyah.**² For Salafiyyah is the deen of Allāh and Allāh did not place it in the hand of

² **[Translator's Note]:** of the Salafi Shaykhs who have strongly criticised Dr Muhammad bin Hādī include Shaykh Sultān al-'Eeid, of the Salafi Shaykhs from Riyadh, KSA. Shaykh Sultān authored a book entitled *an-Naseehah li-Āmat il-Ikhwān wa Īdāh il-Kadhib wa'l-Buhtān (Hiwār ma' Shaykh Muhammad bin Hādī)* [Advice to the Generality of Brothers and a Clarification of Lying and Falsehood: A Discussion with Shaykh Muhammad bin Hādī]. Shaykh Sultān al-'Eeid states in the book, on p.3:

Some beloved brothers within the Kingdom and outside of it, from Ahl ul-Ilm, requested that I expose this evil method and refute the rumours and claims of our brother, Shaykh Muhammad bin Hādī so that those with little knowledge do not get deceived. **I have written this clarification based on written proofs from our brother Muhammad bin Hādī because the man is a coward and does not openly declare his slander on audio tapes or books. Our brother Shaykh**

any one person and none is expelled from it except with a Divinely Legislated reason, all praise is due to Allāh.

Unfortunately, many people prefer silence and non-confrontation so as to be secure from what some people, in the name of “Salafiyyah” and “Sunnah”, practice of terrorism with all who do not agree with them, yes this is the reality. Many people prefer non-confrontation due to terrorism

Muhammad has spread rumours which he has not brought any evidences for up to now!! Wallāhi he does not enter the house from its doors and does not follow the Shari’ way of giving advice. Up to now he has not come to us with any enquiry, communication or letter about the falsehoods which he has promoted. We wish that he would raise the matter to our senior scholars if what he has spread is true, but he has rejected doing this!

Shaykh Sultān also says in the book, p.5:

Our noble brother Shaykh Muhammad bin Hādī has been speaking about my honour and religion for three years and I have been silent for three years for the following reasons:

1. What he has mentioned about me are merely false suspicions, delusions and hypothetical ideas, so he says things like “**you will see**” and “**I know more than you all know**” and “**my words will soon become clear to you**” and “**thiqāt have narrated to me**” and then he is not even able to name these “**thiqāt**”?! This is what Muhammad bin Hādī used to refute Shaykh Fālih for and then Muhammad bin Hādī falls into it himself!!

Shaykh Sultān also says on page 10-11, summarised from point no.10:

After this clarification came out and the talbees [deception] of this noble brother Muhammad bin Hādī was exposed along with those around him, we did not find from them a knowledge-based answer. All we heard, as usual, were claims with no daleel and their sayings which we always hear like “we know more about the reality” and “so and so defends fulān against fulān”!

From their methods is: to raise the flag of defending Ahl ul-Ilm and respect for them, even though they are the same ones who take Ahl ul-Ilm out of Salafiyyah, make tabdī’ of them and slander their honour and deen! Then they claim to respect Ahl ul-Ilm!? May Allāh fight against evil desires! Shaykh al-Ubaykān spoke the truth when he said: “they warn from Hizbiyyah and then fall into clear Hizbiyyah themselves!”

Shaykh Sultān’s book can be downloaded from here: <http://www.sultanal3eed.com/book/>

which he sees, hears and lives with from those of your followers who are biased towards you. One of the brothers from Algeria mentioned to me, and I do not want to mention his name so that he will not come to any harm, that he asked one of the Mashāyikh: “why are you silent while you see how they drop Ahl us-Sunnah one by one?” The Shaykh responded to him saying: “I am like the believing family of the Pharaoh who hid their īmān”!!? Allāhu Akbar! The terrorism of those who differ with you has reached this extent!?

There are many witnesses to this especially in Britain, France, America and elsewhere. Indeed, the matter has even reached the extent where some of those who are biased towards you seek help from disbelieving authorities against those who oppose them in tabdī’ of so and so or in their receiving so and so or praying in Masjid so and so!? While others come to harm in regards to their wives and children, and there are many testimonies and events in this regard, from Allāh we came and unto Him we shall return. After this introduction I want to say the following to you and your followers:

One: O Shaykh Muhammad, may Allāh forgive you, your brothers and your students. The Words of Allāh are that which

“Falsehood cannot approach it from before it or from behind it; [it is] a revelation from a [Lord who is] Wise and Praiseworthy.”

{*al-Fussilat* (41): 42}

The Words of Allāh are that wherein,

“...verses are perfected...”

{*Hūd* (11): 1}

The Words of Allāh are that which,

“Say, "If mankind and the jinn gathered in order to produce the like of this Qur’ān, they could not produce the like of it, even if they were to each other assistants.””

{*al-Isrā’* (17): 88}

The Words of Allāh are,

“...about which there is no doubt...”

{*al-Baqarah* (2): 2}

The Words of Allāh do not contain difference based on Allāh Saying,

“If it had been from [any] other than Allāh, they would have found within it much contradiction.”

{*an-Nisā’ (4): 82*}

The ruling of Allāh requires no commentary,

“And Allāh decides; there is no adjuster of His decision. And He is swift in account.”

{*ar-Ra’d (13): 41*}

And Allāh Says,

“Indeed, the Qur’ān is a decisive statement, And it is not amusement.”

{*at-Tāriq (86): 13-14*}

As for your words and rulings O Shaykh Muhammad, then they are not like that as they can be prone to deficiency, error, difference, disorder, addition, detractions, then what about those who are biased fanatics unto you and are almost unable to differentiate between the Words of Allāh, Mighty and Majestic, and your words?! And they are almost unable to differentiate between the Ruling of Allāh and your rulings!? I would not be exaggerating as you may think, for by the One in Whose Hand is my would, they do not accept any criticism of your words as if whoever criticises you has criticised the Words of Allāh or Allāh’s Ruling. This is not new to the Muslims as those who are fanatically towards a Madhhab, method, creed or party reject texts from the Qur’ān and Sunnah and say “the Imām or the scholar or the Shaykh or the leader “has more knowledge of the Book and Sunnah” however this is neither known nor customary with Ahl us-Sunnah.

Two: O Shaykh Muhammad – inform me and our followers, and finally all of the people: Are you infallible? Does it necessitate all who hear your words and arguments to be convinced and answer to you in all that you incline towards? Are you never ever prone to error in your rulings on people be it a Jarh or a Ta’deel? What is the ruling on the one who does not listen to your words, arguments and proofs? Or the one who is not convinced by them? If your answer is “yes, infallible, my words are binding”, then what is the difference between Muhammad bin ‘Abdullāh, the Messenger of Allāh (*sallallāhu ‘alayhi wassallam*) and Muhammad bin Hādī al-Madkhalī? But if your answer is “no”, then why this storm, warfare, battles, cursing and verbal abuse of the one who criticises you or does not agree with you?

Three: I was astonished, as were others, at that wastefulness which was almost unable to find a limit in cursing, verbal abuse and defamation like their saying: “liar”, “fabricator”, “person of desires”, “fallen”, “Mudallis”, “sick”, “no shame”, “confused”, “small”, “he flips the reality”, “he has no justice or fairness”, “ignorant”, “unknown [Majhūl]”, “contradicts himself”, “may Allāh fight him”, “Mumayyī”, “deluded”, “like a drunkard”, “his throne has fallen”, “his horn has broken” etc. Not to mention other such vocab from the Dictionary of Cursing and Verbal Abuse. All of this just because I criticised you or refuted you...

Four: I contemplated the context in which Allāh Said,

“Do they not think that they will be resurrected, For a tremendous Day...”

{*al-Mutaffifeen* (83): 4-5}

I found that Allāh threatened those who give less in regards to selling a Sa’ah of barley or its like for two Sa’ahs so Allāh Said

“Woe to those who give less [than due], Who, when they take a measure from people, take in full. But if they give by measure or by weight to them, they cause loss.”

{*al-Mutaffifeen* (83): 1-3}

SubhānAllāh how they curse people day and night as if they do not think that they will stand before Allāh who will take them account?

“Do they not think that they will be resurrected, For a tremendous Day - The Day when mankind will stand before the Lord of the worlds?”

{*al-Mutaffifeen* (83): 4-6}

Five: may Allāh have mercy on al-ʿAllāmah al-Muhaddith Shaykh al-Albānī who spent a long time in the da’wah to Tasfiyah and Tarbiyah. At the end of his life he said:

I have spent many years in our da’wah calling to Tasfiyah and Tarbiyah, Tasfiyah [purification] of Islām from that which is not from it being ascribed to it, and Tarbiyah [cultivation] of the Muslim youth upon action in accordance with Islām. All praise is due to Allāh that which has been achieved in regards to Tasfiyah has been, however there is still a major deficiency in regards to Tarbiyah.

Or thereabouts as he said, this is truly what has been observed from many of those who ascribe to the da'wah Salafiyyah, they curse and abuse and when they are reminded they do not remember and when they are encouraged to fear Allāh they do not fear. I have tried them and dealt with them with goodness and some of them use the vilest forms of verbal abuse.

So I say that perhaps I should repel in a way which is better for me and him and based on Allāh Saying,

“Repel [evil] by that [deed] which is better; and thereupon the one whom between you and him is enmity [will become] as though he was a devoted friend.”

{*al-Fussilat (41): 34*}

I say to him: may Allāh forgive you and your parents, may Allāh pardon you, may Allāh guide you. Then he returns and abuses again more than the first time! So I say to him: “do not curse, fear Allāh, for the Prophet (*sallAllāhu 'alayhi wassallam*) said: “*Cursing a Muslim is sin.*” Then he increases in cursing, abuse and transgression! So I say to him: “that’s shameful, you are older than me”, then he returns again and repeats his cursing and accusations moreso! So I say to him: “Allāh will grant me your good deeds on the Day of Judgement, fear Allāh”. Then he increases his cursing twice over!

Where is your Tarbiyah O Shaykh Muhammad of your students?! Do you not know that the children and students with their behaviour manifest the reality of the cultivation of their fathers and Shaykhs. O Shaykh Muhammad do you not fear that the people will understand that you advise them with that? If you do not advise them with that then why do you not forbid them [from that behaviour]? Why do you not advise them to adorn themselves with good and praiseworthy characteristics so that they do not distort the image of Salafiyyah which they have certainly distorted. Why do you not announce that so that all the people will know that you are not pleased with their strange methods? Forbid them from that childish behaviour so that the opposers do not defame us as a result.

Six: O Shaykh Muhammad, your followers do not hear any criticism or refutation of you, or discussion with you, except that they start producing *Tazkiyāt* [commendations] from here and there. They say that “he has been commended by so and so” and “he has been praised by so and so”. Do *Tazkiyāt* [commendations] from the 'Ulama to a particular person indicate his innocence, freedom and infallibility from error and criticism?! What is with you how do you judge?! As if they do not differentiate between the Prophet’s Tazkiyah which is supported by the Clear Revelation

and the Tazkiyah of others! Then Shaykh Muhammad, inform me how your back can take all of this? And how your neck does not break from such praise?

Seven: many of those who are fanatic towards you need Tazkiyāt, so if it is said to them: “also the person whom you have dropped, who of course is only ‘dropped’ in your eyes, has been commended and praised by so and so”. They say in response: “**yes, however he [the one criticised] has changed**” or “**the one who praises him does not know Jarh wa’t-Ta’deel**” or “**the one who praises him is not specialised in Jarh wa’t-Ta’deel like Shaykh so and so**” or “**the one who commends him does not know what happened to him later**” or “**the one commending him has not come across his reality**”. If we were to accept for arguments sake that such words were accurate, or that some were accurate, then why cannot the same be said about your followers [Shaykh Muhammad]? We wait for an answer from you and I think that it will not at all happen!

Eight: O Shaykh Muhammad, as you are not infallible, why do you include all who advise you or highlight your errors as being under the remit of censure? What if he made ijtihād in his advice and then erred, will he not have one reward and be rewarded for his advice?

Nine: Due to this approach of attack you prevent yourself from accepting advice, while Allāh described His successful believing servants who are free from loss,

“...and advised each other to truth...”

{*al-’Asr (103): 3*}

Ten: does the young student of knowledge have the right to append to what was stated by those who have more knowledge and are more senior than them? This is with the knowledge that I am older than you Shaykh Muhammad I think, if I am not wrong, by four years.

Eleven: I have lived during the era of the notable Shaykhs and senior Imāms and I sat with our Shaykh Muhammad bin Sālih al-’Uthaymeen (*rahimabullāh*) for years. By the One in Whose Hand is my soul, I never ever heard from them at all that they cursed or verbally abused anyone or said “so and so is vile”, “so and so is jāhil”, “so and so is a liar”. Rather, what we knew from them is that they were careful how they spoke and advised people in a way which is upright. They would criticise the saying rather than the one who said it, and if compelled they would mention the names with lofty titles and would say “the noble Shaykh” or “the brother” or “the respected Dr, may

Allāh grant him success” and the likes. This is what occurred most of the time according to what I know. Whoever does not accept what I say can refer to the Fatāwā of Shaykh al-’Allāmah al-Imām ’Abdul’Azeez bin ’Abdullāh bin Bāz to learn his manners, mercy, gentleness and knowledge, may Allāh have mercy on him and raise his rank in the Paradise. O Shaykh Muhammad, may Allāh preserve you, I have not yet finished and I will write a third letter to you insha’Allāh, perhaps Allāh will benefit you and your students with it.

I ask Allāh to avert fitan from us, that which of it is apparent and that which is hidden, all praise is due to Allāh firstly, finally, apparently and inwardly, and may prayers, peace and blessings be upon or Prophet Mubammad, his family and all of his companions.